

Compliance Audit Committee Meeting Minutes

May 24, 2023, 6:00 p.m. Committee Room

Present: Richard Austin

Joe Brown Kalli Chapman

Also Present: Mary Medeiros, Director, Legislative Services/City Clerk

Adam Foran, Elections Officer

Laura Davis, Manager, Legislative Services/Deputy City Clerk

Appointment of Chair

In accordance with the Joint Compliance Audit Committee Administrative Practices and Procedures, the Director, Legislative Services/City Clerk called the meeting to order and introduced members of the Committee and staff present. The Director, Legislative Services/City Clerk asked for a motion to appoint a Chair for the Joint Compliance Audit Committee.

Moved By Richard Austin

That Joe Brown be appointed as Chair of the Joint Compliance Audit Committee.

Motion Carried

Joe Brown assumed the Chair and reviewed the purpose and format for the meeting, stating that the purpose of the meeting is to review three reports prepared by the City Clerk pursuant to Section 88.34 (2) of the Municipal Elections Act, each concerning a contravention of the contribution limits set out in Section 88.9 of the Act.

The Chair advised that the order of business will be dealt with as presented on the agenda.

Additional Agenda Items

JCAC-23-06 - Joe Ingino Submitting Correspondence concerning Contributions to his 2022 Municipal Election Campaign

Moved By Kalli Chapman

That Correspondence JCAC-23-06 from Joe Ingino concerning contributions to his 2022 Municipal Election campaign be added to the agenda for the Joint Compliance Audit Committee meeting of May 24, 2023 and considered with Reports JCAC-23-01 and JCAC-23-03.

Declarations of Pecuniary Interest

No declarations of interest were made.

Consideration of Reports from City Clerk

Report 1 - Apparent contravention by D. Jamieson of the contribution limits to candidates

JCAC-23-01- Apparent contravention by D. Jamieson of the contribution limits to candidates for the 2022 Municipal Election in the City of Oshawa (All Wards)

The Chair asked if D. Jamieson was present at the meeting. Joe Ingino, the affected candidate in the matter, advised he was present and representing the contributors to his campaign. Members of the Joint Compliance Audit Committee questioned Joe Ingino concerning Report JCAC-23-01. Joe Ingino confirmed that he was appointed by D. Jamieson and R. Russo to represent them at this meeting.

Members of the Committee questioned Joe Ingino regarding the additional letter and unsigned, amended financial statement and auditor's report form submitted as additional item JCAC-23-06. Joe Ingino advised that he completed the revised, unsigned statements himself, however he entrusted one of his clerks to complete the original statement. Joe Ingino stated that the clerk made a clerical error resulting in the apparent over contribution. In response to questions, Joe Ingino confirmed that he signed the declaration on the original financial statement under Box B declaring that to the best of his knowledge the statements were true and correct, however stated that he should have taken more time to review them.

In response to further questions, Joe Ingino stated that a clerk in his campaign allocated \$1356 as a contribution from one individual and they failed to break it up like they should have as \$356 of the contribution was from another contributor. Joe Ingino indicated this same situation occurred with the donations from both D. Jamieson and R. Russo.

Members of the Committee asked how Joe Ingino knew in April of 2022 that he would need exactly \$356 to pay back the excessive contribution from either Mr. Jessome (as identified on the revised, unsigned statements) or R. Russo. Joe Ingino advised that his campaign planned how many signs to purchase in advance and then make expenditures based on what funds are available.

In response to questions from the Committee, Joe Ingino confirmed that the apparent overcontributions were paid back in cash, and he had no bank statements or receipts on hand to provide to the Committee.

Joe Ingino stated that he hoped this information would clear up the confusion, and advised that he would have resolved it immediately had he received earlier notification from the City Clerk. Joe Ingino stated that he only received notice of the meeting a few days prior. The Chair asked the City Clerk to confirm how and when notice was served. The Elections Officer stated that the notifications were sent via registered mail to the affected candidate in addition to being placed on the City's website. The Elections Officer advised that the notices were processed by the City on May 10, 2023 and that a notice card was left at the address provided by the candidate on May 11, 2023 indicating

where and when to pick it up. The Elections Officer also advised a final notice card was issued at the same address on May 16, 2023 but to date, had not been collected.

The Committee deliberated in private pursuant to Section 88.34(9.1) of the Municipal Elections Act commencing at 6:24 p.m.

The Committee resumed deliberations in public session at 6:47 p.m.

Members of the Joint Compliance questioned Joe Ingino concerning the name of the contributor noted in Report JCAC-23-01 listed as D. Jamieson of 404 Maplewood Road, as the revised, unsigned statements indicate a contribution from D. Jessome at the same address with a contribution of \$1000. Joe Ingino confirmed the contributor's name is D. Jessome at 404 Maplewood Road and the name on the original filing was incorrect.

In response to questions, Joe Ingino confirmed that Mr. Jessome was aware that he was present at the meeting of the Joint Compliance Audit Committee to represent Mr. Jessome in this matter.

Members of the Committee requested the City Clerk confirm service of notice of the meeting to the contributors. The Elections Officer advised that both notices were sent via registered mail and processed by City Hall on May 10, 2023 to be delivered to the D. Jamison listed on the original financial statements and Rosaldo Russo. A notice card was left at the address for D. Jamieson on May 11, 2023 and a final notice issued to the address on May 17, 2023. A notice card was left at the address of R. Russo on May 11, 2023 and delivered successfully to Mr. Russo on May 12, 2023.

Members of the Committee asked if both Mr. Jessome and Mr. Russo had been in contact prior to May 24, 2023 and requested that Joe Ingino attend on their behalf. Joe Ingino confirmed this was correct.

The Committee further deliberated in private pursuant to Section 88.34 (9.1) of the Municipal Elections Act commencing at 6:54 p.m.

The Committee resumed deliberations in public session at 7:00 p.m.

Moved By Richard Austin

That based on Report JCAC-23-01 concerning an apparent contravention of the contribution limits to candidates for the 2022 Municipal Election in the City of Oshawa, the Joint Compliance Audit Committee commence a legal proceeding against the contributor identified as D. Jessome for an apparent contravention of the Municipal Elections Act.

Motion Carried

Moved By Kalli Chapman

That the order of the agenda be altered to consider Report JCAC-23-03 at this time.

Motion Carried

JCAC-23-03- Apparent contravention by Rosaldo Russo of the contribution limits to candidates for the 2022 Municipal Election in the City of Oshawa (All Wards)

Moved By Richard Austin

That based on Report JCAC-23-03 concerning an apparent contravention by Rosaldo Russo of the contribution limits to candidates for the 2022 Municipal Election in the City of Oshawa, the Joint Compliance Audit Committee commence legal proceedings against the contributor for an apparent contravention of the Municipal Elections Act.

Motion Carried

Report 2 - Apparent contravention by Quito Maggi of the contribution limits to candidates

JCAC-23-02- Apparent contravention by Quito Maggi of the contribution limits to candidates for the 2022 Municipal Election in the City of Oshawa (All Wards)

Members of the Joint Compliance Audit Committee questioned Jonathan Giancroce.

Jonathan Giancroce advised that his campaign has rectified the overcontribution and a cheque for reimbursement has been provided to the contributor and cashed. Members of the Committee confirmed the receipt of such documentation would be included as part of the official record of the matter; the City Clerk advised all information related to the report including the additional evidence from both the affected candidate and the contributor would be retained together.

In response to questions from the Committee, the Elections Officer advised that notice of this meeting was served via registered mail to both the affected candidate and the contributor, processed by City Hall on May 10, 2023. Mr. Maggi, the contributor, picked up his notice on May 11, 2023. The affected candidate was advised his notice was available on May 11, 2023 and was picked up on May 19, 2023.

Moved By Richard Austin

That based on Report JCAC-23-02 concerning an apparent contravention by Quito Maggi of the contribution limits to candidates for the 2022 Municipal Election in the City of Oshawa, the Joint Compliance Audit Committee not commence legal proceedings.

Motion Carried

JCAC-23-04- Correspondence received from contributor Quito Maggi concerning a refund from the Jonathan Giancroce Campaign (All Wards)

Correspondence JCAC-23-04 from Quito Maggi concerning a refund from the Jonathan Giancroce Campaign was considered with Report JCAC-23-02.

JCAC-23-05- Correspondence from candidate Jonathan Giancroce concerning a contribution by Quito Maggi to the Jonathan Giancroce Campaign (All Wards)

Correspondence JCAC-23-05 from Jonathan Giancroce concerning a contribution by Quito Maggi to his 2022 Municipal Election campaign was considered with Report JCAC-23-02.

Report 3 - Apparent contravention by Rosaldo Russo of the contribution limits to candidates (See Report 1)

Adjournment

Moved By Kalli Chapman

That the meeting adjourn at 7:10 p.m.

Motion Carried